

# **Thirty-Eighth Plenary Meeting September 29-30, 2016 Executive Summary**

---

Threat Reduction Advisory Committee



This is a report of the Threat Reduction Advisory Committee (TRAC).

The TRAC is a Federal Advisory Committee established to provide independent advice to the Secretary of Defense. Statements, opinions, conclusions, and recommendations in this report do not necessarily represent the official position of the Department of Defense (DoD) or any other entity of the United States Government.



October 6, 2016

**MEMORANDUM FOR THE OFFICE OF THE ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF DEFENSE FOR  
NUCLEAR, CHEMICAL AND BIOLOGICAL DEFENSE PROGRAMS**

SUBJECT: Executive Summary of the Thirty-Eighth Meeting of the Department of Defense  
Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

---

This memorandum formally transmits the Threat Reduction Advisory Committee's Executive Summary of the Thirty-Eighth Plenary meeting held September 29-30, 2016 in Arlington, VA and Washington, D.C.

Ambassador Ronald F. Lehman, II  
Chair  
Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

OPR: J2/5-AC (Advisory Committees and Programs Office)

DATE: October 6, 2016

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

Threat Reduction Advisory Committee

Thirty-Eighth Plenary Meeting

Executive Summary

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ..... 1

ANNEX A: Plenary Meeting Agenda ..... 7

ANNEX B: Plenary Attendees. .... 9

ANNEX C: Current Members ..... 11

ANNEX D: TRAC Management Staff..... 13

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Thirty-Eighth meeting of the Department of Defense (DoD) Threat Reduction Advisory Committee (TRAC) convened at CENTRA Technologies, Inc., Arlington, Virginia, September 29-30, 2016.

In accordance with Section 10(d) of the Federal Advisory Committee Act, as amended, 5 U.S.C. Appendix and 41 C.F.R. § 102-3.155, it was determined that this meeting of the TRAC concerned classified information and matters covered by 5 U.S.C. § 552b(c)(1) and as such, the meeting was closed to the public. The meeting subject matter involved classified information directly related to national security issues. Access to such information is limited to personnel with appropriate security clearances and a specific “need to know.” Disclosure of the TRAC deliberations would have a grave impact on U.S. national security. While all activities were announced in the Federal Register, the public was not invited in order to protect U.S. national security. Appendices A and B list the meeting agenda and attendees.

The TRAC Designated Federal Officer (DFO), Mr. Stephen Polchek, opened the Thirty-Eighth TRAC Plenary by addressing recent changes in TRAC support staff. He then provided an overview of the plenary agenda and reminded all members that TRAC notebooks were limited to secret material only. Mr. Polchek concluded his remarks and turned the meeting over to the Defense Threat Reduction Agency’s (DTRA) Advisory Committees and Programs Director, Mr. Bill Hostyn.

Mr. Hostyn discussed the upcoming change of the fiscal year and noted the high likelihood that the DoD would be operating under a continuing resolution (CR). Due to the limitation of funds under a CR, the proposed meeting with Secretary of Defense (SD) Ash Carter would be limited to members located in the Washington D.C. metro area. He then informed the TRAC that the proposed plenary in November at U.S. Special Operations Command (USSOCOM), Tampa Bay, FL had been refined to a three day window from the fifteenth to the seventeenth. The Joint Special Operations University has expressed interest in hosting a weapons of mass destruction (WMD) panel of TRAC members to field questions within their areas of expertise. After concluding his remarks Mr. Hostyn asked the TRAC Chair, Ambassador (Amb.) Ronald Lehman to provide opening remarks.

Amb. Lehman reminded the members that the TRAC has no subgroups but rather, when presented with Terms of Reference (TORs) from DoD, they form fact finding preparatory groups (prep groups), from within the current membership to finalize products and present findings and recommendations to the full TRAC for deliberation. He then relayed that Under Secretary of Defense for Acquisition, Technology, and Logistics (USD/AT&L) Frank Kendall wants the TRAC to stay active over the transition to the new administration following the November elections. Amb.

Lehman noted that he sees the success of the TRAC, not in the reports it generates, but in the interactions and discussions with various DoD organizations that lead to the reports. He mentioned he was looking forward to the scheduled out brief with Deputy Secretary of Defense (DSD) Robert Work where they would be presenting awards to departing members, presenting updates on current TORs, and starting a discussion on future TORs. Due to the available dates of the planned visit to USSOCOM, Amb. Lehman was unsure if a quorum of members would be available and that the trip may be a visit and not a plenary, as currently planned. Going forward, Amb. Lehman suggested that holding two plenary meetings a year should be the goal while continuing to rely on the prep groups to gather the bulk of the material needed to deliberate on current and future TORs. Additionally, scheduling of plenary meetings should be flexible to allow for last minute changes to the SD or DSD availability. He concluded his opening remarks addressing the rotation of TRAC members. Instead of four members changing out every year, he sees the need for only three to meet the goals of USD Kendall. Members that are interested in continuing their service may return after rotating off for a short period. In his case, Amb. Lehman had been extended until 2020 but is planning on resigning his appointment in 2018.

The TRAC vice chair, Dr. Miriam John, asked Amb. Lehman what the TRAC needs to do to be prepared to support the transition of the Counter WMD mission from U.S. Strategic Command (USSTRATCOM) to USSOCOM. Vice Admiral (VADM) Robert S. Harward, USN, Retired, suggested the TRAC needs to ensure Joint Special Operations Command (JSOC) knows what assets the TRAC has that apply to JSOC mission areas, provide examples of past TRAC success, and present how the TRAC sees itself helping JSOC with their execution of the Counter WMD mission. Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense (DASD) John Burnham agreed with VADM Harward and provided a few additional points to present to JSOC. In preparation for the visit Dr. John requested copies of the draft implementation plan so the TRAC could identify any gaps that may exist in the transition.

Following the discussion of the Counter WMD mission change, Amb. Lehman noted that USSOCOM had recently expressed interest in receiving support from the TRAC to assist with the challenges of countering WMD. In response, USD Kendall requested draft TORs to address the transition, along with two more TORs, addressing modernization of nuclear forces and the integration of the Joint Improvised-Threat Defeat Organization (JIDO) under DTRA.

The meeting then transitioned to Top Secret / Sensitive Compartmented Information (TS/SCI) topics requiring all unauthorized personnel to depart so the TRAC could receive two briefings from a panel of presenters from the intelligence community.

Following a short break, Dr. William Schneider provided a classified presentation on Cross Domain Deterrence based on the work of the Defense Science Board's Task Force on deterring,

preventing, and responding to the threat or use of WMD. All material presented was pre-decisional and not finalized for publication.

As Dr. Arthur Hopkins, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Nuclear, Chemical and Biological Programs, was unable to attend as scheduled during the working lunch, DASD Majidi & DASD Burnham presented classified remarks on the Unified Command Plan changes and implications for the DoD Counter WMD mission.

After the working lunch, Dr. John introduced Dr. Brad Roberts as a former TRAC member and recent author of “The Case for U.S. Nuclear Weapons in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.” Dr. Roberts led a classified discussion on redefining the U.S. agenda for nuclear disarmament.

Following Dr. Roberts’ discussion, the meeting transitioned to a member only session to deliberate findings from the Countering Weapons of Mass Destruction (CWMD): A Case Study of North Korea (NK) TOR. During this session the Committee reviewed their summer trip to South Korea, which included visits to U.S. Forces Korea, U.S. Embassy (Seoul), and U.S. Pacific Command (USPACOM). Honorable (Hon.) Michael Nacht and Ms. Eileen Vergino presented their findings, remaining issues, and recommendations so the TRAC could reach consensus on final recommendations for USD Kendall.

Hon. Susan J. Koch and Dr. John F. Reichart followed CWMD NK deliberations, updating the Committee on the recent activities and progress of the Russian Strategy and Force Development prep group. They were followed by Hon. Joseph A. Benkert and Dr. Melissa G. Choi providing the Committee an update on the Chinese WMD Operations prep group’s recent activities and progress.

The first day concluded with the individual prep group leaders meeting to plan and prepare remarks for the Senior Leader out brief to DSD Work the following day.

Day two opened with Amb. Lehman reviewing points for that afternoon’s presentation to DSD Work reminding all of the time constraints due to DSD Work’s schedule and the need to present awards to the departing TRAC members. He then requested the membership discuss USD Kendall’s suggested areas of focus for 2017: sufficiency of the nuclear triad, JIDO merger with DTRA, and the UCP change in Counter WMD from USSTRATCOM to USSOCOM.

Dr. Thomas Bates then joined the meeting to present a classified briefing on emerging threats based on technological advancements in biotechnology. This briefing continued through lunch.

Following the briefing from Dr. Bates, the meeting was suspended so members could travel to the Pentagon for the Senior Leader out brief to DSD Work.



USD Kendall introduced Amb. Lehman and Dr. John as the TRAC Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. He then suggested that DSD Work make a few opening remarks.

DSD Work opened by stating recent activities by the North Koreans were of particular concern and he looked forward to hearing what the TRAC had concluded. He then recommended that they first address the two individuals who were to receive the Office of the Secretary of Defense Medal for Exceptional Public Service. DSD Work asked Amb. Robert Joseph and Dr. John Reichart to stand and join him at the head of the table. After reviewing their extensive list of military, civilian, and private sector service, DSD Work presented both gentlemen with their awards, and a personal gift of a Deputy Secretary of Defense coin and pen.

Following the award presentations, DSD Work asked Amb. Lehman to make a few remarks. Amb. Lehman noted how the TRAC supports the Department of Defense, not always through published reports, but rather by staying close to DoD leadership to provide timely assistance and advice; such as during the Syrian chemical weapon elimination work and DTRA mission area review. By the end of calendar year 2016, the TRAC will complete reports on three current studies, based on TORs approved by USD/AT&L, and will conduct a plenary meeting at USSOCOM. USD Kendall pointed out that the TRAC has supported the DoD, through the OUSD(AT&L), for many years now and is looking forward to supporting the next administration.

Amb. Lehman then introduced the “CWMD in North Korea” prep group leadership; HON Michael Nacht and Ms. Eileen Vergino. HON Nacht and Ms. Vergino presented the classified key findings and recommendations deliberated on the previous day by the entire TRAC. After hearing their presentation, DSD Work provided a classified update to the TRAC on the current administration’s plan and opinion of activities in North Korea. USD Kendall then requested that the TRAC look at any gaps in capability that the U.S. might have in light of the new guidance from the DSD.

Next, HON Susan Koch and Dr. John Reichart provided an update on the status of fact finding and observations in the Russia prep group. They closed their summary stating they plan to complete their research and report by the end of the calendar year. Their presentation garnered DSD Work’s attention to which he requested a follow on discussion with the Russian experts at a later date.

In a follow up to DSD Work’s request for another discussion, HON Koch asked what deterrence is today and suggested that the DoD rethink intra-war deterrence. DSD Work responded, laying out the three stages of deterrence that he sees. The first is strategic deterrence, primarily consisting of cyber and nuclear. The second is conventional deterrence. The relationship between the first and second stages is escalation management. The third stage is managing strategic competition. Just as escalation management is the mechanism between the first and second stage, crisis management is the mechanism acting between the second and third stages.

Amb. Lehman then introduced HON Joseph Benkert and Dr. Melissa Choi as the co-leaders of the China prep group. They provided DSD Work short remarks focused on the classified observations of their research. Following their observations, Amb. Lehman noted to DSD Work that there appears to be some intertwining of Russia and China. DSD Work requested the TRAC consider alternate means of supporting allies in the region that had been used in other regions or had been in use in previous flare ups in the region but not currently active.

As DSD Work's time with the TRAC was ending he thanked them for their efforts, noted that the next administration would need to look into these three areas and would be well served by the TRAC reports. Additionally, DoD is transitioning to threat based planning and the TRAC's activities fall in line with the new process.

Following DSD Work's departure, USD Kendall took over as host for the meeting and began by discussing future topics suitable for the Committee. He stated the next administration may be interested in reviewing the Intermediate-Range Nuclear Forces (INF) treaty and questioning the current status quo. Amb. Lehman implied this would also involve a review of the geostrategic status of EURASIA. USD Kendall agreed, noting that China has not changed their policies. Amb. Lehman suggested an alternative might be to look at what the DoD needs and then study what makes sense to meet that need. The TRAC is well positioned to look at the Counter WMD mission change from USSTRATCOM to USSOCOM, resulting from the President's change to the Unified Command Plan in July. USD Kendall agreed, especially as the TRAC prepares for a plenary at USSOCOM in November.

USD Kendall asked Acting Under Secretary of Defense for Policy Brian McKeon if he had any thoughts to add. USD McKeon stated that the TRAC should take a hard look at how the DoD shapes the nuclear triad. Any results in the near term would be very timely considering the future administration changes. He also agreed with USD Kendall that the INF will be an issue the next administration needs to address and that the TRAC is well served to take up the issue.

After USD McKeon's remarks, Dr. John recommended the TRAC look into the emerging chemical and biological issues facing the DoD.

In closing, USD Kendall suggested another TRAC study on Russia concerning, not only what the U.S. is doing regarding Russian actions and policy but also what Russia thinks the U.S. is doing. He suggested that the DoD's progress on prompt global strike and advances in missile defense are of great concern to Russia. Counter space also is emerging as a misunderstood capability between the U.S. and Russia. USD Kendall closed his comments by asking the TRAC, as a potential topic for a study, if the DoD has the right balance between chemical, biological, and nuclear counter proliferation. After the Under Secretary left the conference room, Amb. Lehman adjourned the plenary meeting at 1515 on September 30, 2016.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

## ANNEX A: Thirty-Eighth Plenary Meeting Agenda

Thursday, September 29, 2016

CENTRA Technology, Inc., 3<sup>RD</sup> Floor, SCIF

### DISCUSSIONS CONDUCTED AT OR ABOVE THE SECRET CLASSIFICATION LEVEL

0800 Sign In / Breakfast

0830 Designated Federal Officer Remarks Mr. Polchek/TRAC

0835 Chairman's Remarks on TRAC Activities Amb. Lehman

0845 Intelligence Briefings ~ TS-SCI Mr. Heil (DIA)

1115 Cross Domain Deterrence ~ TS-SCI Dr. Schneider (DSB)

1230 Working Lunch ~NCB Defense Program Update Mr. Majidi & Mr. Burnham

1330 Blue Red Theory of Deterrence ~ TS/SCI Mr. Roberts (LLNL)

TRAC Preparatory Groups ~ TS/SCI TRAC ONLY

1445 CWMD in North Korea: Deliberations Hon Nacht/Ms. Vergino

1545 Russian Strategy and Force Developments: Updates Hon Koch/Dr. Heichart

1630 Chinese WMD Operations: Updates Hon Benkert/Dr. Choi

1715 Adjourn

Friday, September 30, 2016

CENTRA Technology, Inc. 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, SCIF & Pentagon Cables Room, 3D921

DISCUSSIONS CONDUCTED AT OR ABOVE THE SECRET CLASSIFICATION LEVEL

0800	Sign-In/Breakfast	
0830	Review TRAC Findings/Next Steps for Senior Leader Brief	TRAC ONLY
0900	Discuss Proposed Terms of Reference	TRAC ONLY
0945	Break	
1000	Emerging Biological Threats ~ TS/SCI	Dr. Bates (LLNL)
1130	Working Lunch ~ discussion continues through lunch	TRAC ONLY
1245	Transport to Pentagon Cables Room 3D921	
1400	Senior Leader Out Brief ~ TS/SCI	Amb. Lehman
1402	Brief intro remarks and award presentation	DSD Work
1410	Overview of Preparatory Groups	Amb. Lehman
	CWMD in North Korea: Final Recommendations	Hon Nacht/Ms. Vergino
	Russian Strategy and Force Developments: Updates	Hon Koch/Dr. Reichart
	Chinese WMD Operations: Updates	Hon Benkert/Dr. Choi
1420	Q&A with DSD Work	
1430	Concept Discuss of New Study Efforts	Amb. Lehman
1440	Q&A with USD Kendall	USD Kendall
1500	Adjourn	

## ANNEX B: Thirty-Eighth Plenary Meeting Attendees

Major Nathaniel Allen	Dr. Miriam E. John
Mr. Jason Adams	Mr. Jeff Jordan
Dr. Jason Aulds	Ambassador Robert G. Joseph
Dr. Thomas Bates	Lieutenant General Francis H. Kearney, III, USA, Retired
Honorable Joseph A. Benkert	Honorable Susan J. Koch
Rear Admiral Kenneth W. Bernard, USPHS, Retired	Dr. Michael Kuliasha
Mr. Gary Blore	Ambassador Ronald Lehman
Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense John Burnham	Honorable Michael E. Leiter
Dr. Melissa G. Choi	Mr. Hunter Lutinski
Lieutenant Colonel Bryan Edmunds	Dr. Vahid Majidi
Dr. Amber Engel	Lieutenant Commander Scott Miller
Honorable Richard A. Falkenrath	Honorable Michael Nacht
Mr. Gerald Goodfellow	Mr. Michael O’Keefe
Ms. Donna Gregg	Mr. Stephen Polchek
Mr. Chris Grisafe	Dr. John F. Reichart
Dr. Gigi K. Gronvall	Ms. Anne Renner
Dr. Ronald Hann	Mr. Ed Reynolds
Ms. Jennifer Hartlove	Dr. Brad Roberts
Vice Admiral Robert S. Harward, USN, Retired	Ms. Joan B. Rohlfing
Dr. David Hassell	Dr. William Schneider
Ms. Mary Alice A. Hayward	Dr. Laurie Singer
Mr. William Hostyn	Dr. Jeffrey M. Starr
	Ms. Eileen S. Vergino

Mr. Mike Visotsky

Dr. Nekeitha Wade

Dr. George M. Whitesides

Dr. Rhys Williams

## ANNEX C: Threat Reduction Advisory Committee Membership

### Chairperson

Ambassador Ronald F. Lehman II

### Vice-Chairperson

Dr. Miriam E. John

### Members

Honorable Joseph A. Benkert

Lieutenant General Francis H. Kearney, III,  
USA, Retired

Rear Admiral Kenneth W. Bernard, USPHS,  
Retired

Honorable Susan J. Koch

Dr. Joseph V. Braddock

Honorable Michael E. Leiter

Dr. Melissa G. Choi

Honorable Michael Nacht

Honorable Richard A. Falkenrath

Dr. John F. Reichart

Ms. Donna Gregg

Ms. Joan B. Rohlfig

Dr. Gigi K. Gronvall

Dr. Jeffrey M. Starr

Vice Admiral Robert S. Harward, USN, Retired

Ms. Eileen S. Vergino

Ms. Mary Alice A. Hayward

Dr. George M. Whitesides

Ms. Jill M. Hruby



THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY BLANK

## ANNEX D: TRAC Management Staff

Mr. William P. Hostyn, Director, (703) 767-4453, [william.p.hostyn.civ@mail.mil](mailto:william.p.hostyn.civ@mail.mil) \*

Mr. Stephen J. Polchek, Deputy Director, (703) 767-8891, [stephen.j.polchek.civ@mail.mil](mailto:stephen.j.polchek.civ@mail.mil) \*

Lt Col Bryan Edmunds, WMD Futures Analyst, (703) 767-6976, [bryan.d.edmunds.mil@mail.mil](mailto:bryan.d.edmunds.mil@mail.mil) \*

MAJ Nathaniel A. Allen, Operations Officer, (703) 767-5149, [nathaniel.a.allen.mil@mail.mil](mailto:nathaniel.a.allen.mil@mail.mil)

LCDR Scott T. Miller, WMD Futures Analyst, (703) 767-0207, [scott.t.miller4.mil@mail.mil](mailto:scott.t.miller4.mil@mail.mil)

Mr. Ed Reynolds, WMD Futures Analyst, (703) 767-4277, [edward.c.reynolds8.civ@mail.mil](mailto:edward.c.reynolds8.civ@mail.mil) \*

Mr. Keven McCall, WMD Futures Analyst, (703) 767-0851, [kevin.mccall.civ@mail.mil](mailto:kevin.mccall.civ@mail.mil)

Ms. Wendy L. Eaton, (703) 767-0026, [wendy.l.eaton.ctr@mail.mil](mailto:wendy.l.eaton.ctr@mail.mil)

Mr. Jeff Jordan, (703) 767-5957, [jeffrey.a.jordan.ctr@mail.mil](mailto:jeffrey.a.jordan.ctr@mail.mil)

Ms. Anne E. Renner, (703) 767-2597, [anne.e.renner.ctr@mail.mil](mailto:anne.e.renner.ctr@mail.mil)

---

*\*Designated Federal Officer(s)*

*Please direct all inquiries to the TRAC Management Staff*

